DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 310 661 HE 022 724

AUTHOR Ransom, Angela
TITLE Financing Higher Education in Francophone West Africa. An EDI Policy Seminar Report, Number 12.
INSTITUTION World Bank, Washington, D. C.
PUB DATE 88
NOTE 36p.
AVAILABLE FROM The World Bank, 1818 H St., N.W., Washington, DC 20433 ($10.95).
PUB TYPE Reports - Descriptive (141) -- Collected Works - Conference Proceedings (021)

EDRS PRICE MF01 Plus Postage. PC Not Available from EDRS.
DESCRIPTORS College Curriculum; Economic Development; Educational Development; *Educational Finance; Educational Quality; *Financial Needs; Financial Problems; *Financial Support; *Foreign Countries; *Higher Education; *Resource Allocation; Student Costs
IDENTIFIERS *Africa (West); *College Costs

ABSTRACT

Meetings were held in Senegal in 1985, in Cote d'Ivoire in 1986, and in Zimbabwe in 1987, concerning the current state of higher education finance in Africa, the structure of unit costs, and the role of development assistance agencies and other sources of financial support. Reports are presented concerning the macroeconomic perspective, internal efficiency, external efficiency (manpower and quality), and alternative sources of financing (private sector contributions and student financing). Common views emerged on: (1) the unlikelihood of additional public resources becoming available for higher education; (2) the more efficient use of existing resources; (3) the substantial public sacrifice required to implement adjustment strategies; (4) the need to increase the private costs of higher education, by reducing public expenditures on student subsidies and non-academic expenditures; (5) the need for curriculum and course improvement and promotion of regional collaboration through supra-national institutions; and (6) the need for continued financial and technical support from development assistance agencies. Meeting agendas and participant lists are appended. (KM)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED310661

HE

Economic Development Institute
of The World Bank

Financing Higher Education in Francophone West Africa

Angela Ransom

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)
☐ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.
☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.
• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL IN MICROFICHE ONLY HAS BEEN GRANTED BY
THE WORLD BANK
TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

HE 022 724

AN EDI POLICY SEMINAR REPORT • NUMBER 12

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Policy Seminar Reports numbers 1 through 7 are available from the Economic Development Institute of the World Bank, 1818 H Street, N.W., Washington, D.C. 20433, attention: Ms. Edith A. Pena.

1 *Transport Policies in Francophone Sub-Saharan Africa: Issues and Options.* Hernán Levy. EDI Catalog no. 705/016.

1F *Les politiques de transport en Afrique francophone au sud du Sahara: Problèmes et choix.* Hernán Levy. EDI Catalog no. 705/016.

2 *Food Policy Seminar.* J. Price Gittinger. EDI Catalog no. 505/003.

3 *Agricultural Policy and Its Relationship to Food Policy in Sub-Saharan Africa.* Sakwa Bunyasi. EDI Catalog no. 070/001.

3F *La politique agricole et ses rapports avec la politique alimentaire en Afrique subsaharienne.* Sakwa Bunyasi. EDI Catalog no. 070/001.

4 *Development Policy Analysis.* David G. Davies. EDI Catalog no. 420/043.

5 *Management Training and Research for African Development.* J. Price Gittinger. EDI Catalog no. 430/008.

5F *La formation et la recherche en gestion pour le développement de l'Afrique.* J. Price Gittinger. EDI Catalog no. 430/008.

6 *Land and Water Resources Management.* Jacques J. Kozub, Norman Meyers, and Emmanuel D'Silva. EDI Catalog no. 070/003.

7 *Export Policies and Administration.* Randi B. Greenblatt with Joaquin A. Cottani and Domingo F. Cavallo. EDI Catalog no. 400/047.

The following titles may be purchased from the Publications Sales Unit, World Bank, 1818 H Street, N.W., Washington, D.C. 20433.

8 *The Political Economy of Reform in Sub-Saharan Africa.* Ravi Gulhati.

9 *Transport Policy Issues in Sub-Saharan Africa.* Hernán Levy and Patrick O. Malone.

10 *Políticas de Transporte en América Latina.* Hernán Levy.

11 *Managing Financial Adjustment in Middle-Income Countries.* Alan Roe and Paul A. Popiel.

AN EDI POLICY SEMINAR REPORT • NO. 12

Financing Higher Education in Francophone West Africa

Report on a Series of Meetings held in Dakar, Senegal, March 1985
in Yamoussoukro, Côte d'Ivoire, March 1986
and in Victoria Falls, Zimbabwe, January 1987

Angela Ransom

The World Bank
Washington, D.C.

Copyright © 1988
The International Bank for Reconstruction and Development / THE WORLD BANK
1818 H Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20433, U.S.A.

All rights reserved
Manufactured in the United States of America
First printing September 1988

The Economic Development Institute (EDI) was established by the World Bank in 1955 to train officials concerned with development planning, policymaking, investment analysis, and project implementation in member developing countries. At present the substance of the EDI's work emphasizes macroeconomic and sectoral economic policy analysis. Through a variety of courses, seminars, and workshops, most of which are given overseas in cooperation with local institutions, the EDI seeks to sharpen analytical skills used in policy analysis and to broaden understanding of the experience of individual countries with economic development. In addition to furthering EDI's pedagogical objectives, Policy Seminars provide forums for policymakers, academics, and Bank staff to exchange views on current development issues, proposals, and practices. Although the EDI's publications are designed to support its training activities, many are of interest to a much broader audience. EDI materials, including any findings, interpretations, and conclusions, are entirely those of the authors and should not be attributed in any manner to the World Bank, to its affiliated organizations, or to members of its Board of Executive Directors or the countries they represent.

Because of the informality of this series and to make the publication available with the least possible delay, the typescript has not been prepared and edited as fully as would be the case with a more formal document, and the World Bank accepts no responsibility for errors.

The backlist of publications by the World Bank is shown in the annual *Index of Publications*, which is available from Publications Sales Unit, The World Bank, 1818 H Street, N.W., Washington, D.C. 20433, U.S.A., or from Publications, Banque mondiale, 66, avenue d'Iéna, 75116 Paris, France.

Angela Ransom is a research assistant in the Human Resources Division, Economic Development Institute, The World Bank.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Ransom, Angela, 1956-
Financing higher education in Francophone West Africa.

(EDI policy seminar report ; no. 12)
Bibliography: p.
1. Education, Higher--Africa, French-speaking West--Finance--Congresses. I. Title. II. Series.
LB2342.2.A3545R36 1988 379.1'214'09660097541 88-20746
ISBN 0-8213-1099-2

EDI Catalog No. 135/036 ISSN 1012-490X

Foreword

This document is one of a series reporting on policy seminars organized by the Economic Development Institute of the World Bank. Policy seminars provide a forum for an informal exchange of ideas and experiences among policymakers from different countries, leading experts in development, and World Bank staff, with respect to major issues of development policy.

Policy Seminar Reports focus on issues raised during seminars that may be of interest to a wider audience. They are not intended to be comprehensive proceedings. However, they seek to convey the essence of the discussions that took place and to bring out any principal areas of agreement or disagreement that emerged amongst those participating.

Christopher R. Willoughby
Director
Economic Development Institute
of The World Bank

Contents

Executive Summary *vii*

1. Introduction *1*

2. Macroeconomic Perspective *3*

3. Internal Efficiency *5*

4. External Efficiency *9*

Manpower 9

Quality 10

5. Alternative Sources of Financing *13*

Private Sector Contributions 13

Student Financing 13

6. Conclusions *17*

***Annex.** Program and List of Participants 19*

Dakar 19
Yamoussoukro 23
Victoria Falls 27

Executive Summary

Since gaining independence, African governments have spent a substantial portion of their national budgets to develop the education sector. Investments of this magnitude were justified at the time as a means to produce rapidly the skilled manpower required for economic and social development. The deteriorating economic environment over the last decade, due in part to declining commodity prices and oil price and exchange rate fluctuations, has shrunk national budgets. Simultaneous high levels of demographic growth rates have swollen the ranks of the school-aged population. Pressures to expand education at all levels persist. However, additional public resources for the education sector are not likely to become available in the near future. The challenge for African governments in an environment of rising demand and declining resources is to find new ways to meet demand at lower costs and without sacrificing quality.

The meetings for French-speaking West African ministers of education in Dakar, Senegal in 1985, and in Yamoussoukro, Côte d'Ivoire in 1986, and for university rectors in Victoria Falls, Zimbabwe in 1987 provided opportunities to discuss in a relaxed, informal setting the political feasibility of different policy options and strategies of adjustment to the new fiscal realities. African education officials reiterated the important role of the university in Africa as an expression of national pride and sovereignty. They envisage their universities not only as suppliers of knowledge and technical skills to run their countries, but also as institutions of advanced learning and research with worldwide reputations. Yet when asked to assess the actual efficacy of the university in Africa, most expressed serious doubts about the effectiveness of its teachers, the adequacy of its physical facilities, and the quality of its graduates. These comments set the stage for the major topics of the meetings: the current state of higher education finance in Africa, the structure of unit costs, and the role of donors and development assistance agencies.

Higher education in Africa as it is currently financed does not provide incentives to invest resources in fields that promote development, nor to invest in the amounts of education that most benefit society. Most countries in the region spend more money than they can afford on student subsidies and academic and administrative staff salaries and benefits, and not enough on laboratory equipment, books and journals for libraries, or research and technical training for development. The quality of the education provided has suffered as a result. The meetings explored ways of reducing costs and increasing quality and efficiency.

Even though the meetings did not seek a consensus on any specific policy recommendation, common viewpoints emerged on the following: (1) the unlikelihood of additional public resources becoming available to expand or improve higher education in the region; (2) the possibility of generating additional resources to expand or improve higher education by using existing resources more efficiently; (3) the substantial public

sacrifice required to implement adjustment strategies; (4) the need to increase the private costs of higher education, student subsidies and non-academic expenditures were cited as areas where public expenditure could be reduced despite the political difficulties; (5) the need to rationalize curricula and course offerings and to promote regional collaboration through supra-national institutions; and finally (6) the need for higher education to receive the continued financial and technical support of development assistance agencies.

Education officials have recognized the gravity of the situation of higher education finance. Several have already attempted some technical solutions with varying degrees of success and failure. Notwithstanding, most were uncomfortable with proposals to shift cost savings from higher education to secondary or primary education. It was thought that such savings from politically risky changes to make higher education more efficient might best be reinvested in the sector to improve the quality of African universities.

1
Introduction

Many of the issues and problems associated with the field of education do not lend themselves to purely economic or technical solutions. These are problems that prove intractable not because of a scarcity of managerial capacity, a lack of financing, or low skill levels. They are intractable because professional and political opinion differ on how such issues and problems should be adequately and appropriately addressed. This is the case with respect to issues such as cost recovery in higher education, selection and promotion examinations, or minimum standards of classroom quality.

This series of seminars concentrated upon the problems of diversifying the sources of finance in higher education, including cost recovery mechanisms. This subject is particularly relevant to West African countries because reforms in the financing of higher education are believed to be critical to increasing efficiency in the education sector as a whole. Since the education sector is, moreover, usually the largest of the government sectors, making it more efficient can significantly improve the prospects for general national economic management.

The overall purpose of these meetings was to provide political officials in Africa at the most senior level in the education sector with the opportunity to informally discuss some common problems in the financing of higher education with officials at a similarly senior level in the World Bank, and to create a working relationship between African political authorities and the Bank. The first two meetings, held in Dakar in March 1985 and in Yamoussoukro, Côte d'Ivoire in March 1986, were limited to ministers of education and explored various policy options that have been politically difficult to attain. The third meeting, held in Victoria Falls, Zimbabwe, in January 1987, brought together rectors of Francophone African universities and high level officials from ministries of finance and planning to discuss the feasibility of specific policy options and adjustment strategies.

Discussions focused on (1) an analysis of higher education finance in Francophone West Africa; (2) an examination of the structure of student subsidies and various reform measures; and (3) a review of the role of international cooperation and funding agencies. Brief background papers provided the basic factual information upon which the discussions were built. World Bank staff from policy, projects, and programs departments were present to react to the questions raised, to clarify Bank policy, and to raise related issues of importance when necessary.

This report summarizes the issues discussed and presents some of the strategies and recommendations being considered to readjust the sector. Sections 1 through 4 cover the four themes: macroeconomic perspective, internal efficiency, external efficiency, and alternative sources of financing. Each section presents the main issues and problems, areas of agreement, and recommendations.

2
Macroeconomic Perspective

African governments have invested heavily in education and have achieved impressive results in the short period since independence. However, economic crisis in the 1980s has resulted in deteriorating enrollments and an erosion of education quality and efficiency in many Sub-Saharan African countries. Rapid population growth, declining economic growth, rising external debt, and infrastructural weakness mean that quantitative improvements of the same magnitude that have occurred since independence cannot be expected in the future.

The world economic crisis has increased pressures on national budgets. In the last five years the average growth of GNP in Africa has been 1.7 percent with one out of three countries having negative growth rates. In all but four (out of 40) countries, agriculture output has stagnated. National current account deficits and external debt have increased five-fold. Foreign exchange reserves have declined from comfortable margins in 1970 to approximately two months' imports today. Annual per capita income growth declined from 2.5 percent in the 1960s to 0.4 percent in the 1970s. Projections of population growth rates point to decreasing per capita income. According to a recent World Bank report, the forecast average change in per capita income for low-income African countries over the next ten years is between -0.1 and -0.5 percent per year. In spite of corrective measures now being undertaken, it is likely that the year 2000 will find the average African in a poorer situation than he was in the early 1970s.

Economic and financial crises have precipitated a crisis in the provision of education. Despite progress over a short period of time, Sub-Saharan Africa remains the most undereducated region of the world. Its adult literacy rate on average is only 25 percent, significantly lower than that of South Asia (35 percent), the Middle East (45 percent), Latin America (75 percent), or the middle-income countries of Asia (85 percent). Its primary school enrollment rate is about 70 percent of that of other low-income (International Development Association) regions, and the secondary school enrollment rate is about half. Even for those enrolled, however, the resources available for learning are significantly less in Africa than elsewhere. For instance, Malawi is annually able to purchase about $1.24 in teaching aids and materials for each elementary school pupil. Ecuador is able to afford $9.43, Malaysia $50.00, and Norway $300. Differences in educational facilities create differences in educational product.

Educational budgets in the region typically vary from 18 percent to 30 percent of national budgets. Higher education receives, on average, from 25 percent to 30 percent of total educational expenditures, considerably higher per capita than other levels of education. Due to the pattern of resource allocation and the lack of economies of scale, the costs of higher education in Africa are relatively higher than in Europe, Latin America, and Asia. Results have not been commensurate with the financial efforts expended. There is still need

for specialized professionals from abroad. Only a few countries have been able to produce researchers and doctoral-level graduates or develop research capabilities. At the same time, graduate unemployment is on the rise. National economies are no longer able to absorb graduates in many specializations. There is a heavy concentration of students in the liberal arts and social sciences, and very few qualified students in medicine, engineering, and the sciences. Present economic circumstances make it unlikely that university budgets will increase significantly.

Higher education as it is presently financed, organized, and managed does not produce the manpower needed for the development sectors; the quality of the product has deteriorated; the costs are high; and the criteria for allocating resources are neither efficient nor equitable. National governments, higher education officials, and international organizations recognize that resources for higher education must be increased, and more importantly, must be used more efficiently if African universities are to produce the manpower required for sustained development.

The shift of the World Bank's focus to areas of the economy amenable to policy reform has increased emphasis on major users of public expenditures. Education is often the single largest user of public recurrent expenditure, and at the same time education is essential for economic development. While economic crisis makes policy reform necessary, the acceptable mechanisms of that reform are varied. Mechanisms addressed at these meetings included those designed to improve the efficiency and effectiveness of the provision of higher education and its quality.

3
Internal Efficiency

One of the most critical and complex issues in the higher education sub-sector in Francophone West Africa is the high unit costs to government per graduate. As a percentage of GNP per capita, the average unit cost per student in the region's universities is very high compared to other levels of education—60 times that of the cost of a pupil in primary school. The corresponding figure for Asia and Latin America is between 10 and 15 times. Unit costs as a percentage of GNP are also high compared to other regions of the world—7 times higher than Asia, almost 10 times higher than Latin America, and over 15 times higher than in developed countries.

One reason for such high unit costs is that students pay no fees and receive subsidized allowances for housing, food, transportation, and health care. In many African countries student aid accounts for half of public expenditure in higher education. Repetition and drop-out rates are high among students in higher education. Consequently it takes more public expenditures to produce each graduate and those that do not complete their studies further waste public funds.

Although education officials recognize the need for increased private contribution to the costs of higher education, they do not favor complete elimination of the scholarship system. However, they do recognize that scholarships should be restricted and selectively awarded according to academic and social criteria. They also concede that the present system does not provide incentives for students to try to obtain good results since they keep their scholarships and living allowances regardless of the quality of their performance. Many propose stricter admissions and performance standards as one possible solution. Some changes, in fact, have already been initiated as a result of national educational policies or because universities could no longer afford to keep doing more of the same. The university in the Côte d'Ivoire, for example, has already begun to limit scholarships and to introduce entrance requirements for some technical disciplines. One of the university rectors in the Victoria Falls meeting observed that African universities can no longer afford to grant unlimited access to scholarships, maintain present teaching loads, or perpetuate the present policies regarding student support. There is an awareness that the costs of doing nothing about the structure of resource allocation amounts to turning one's back on developing research or improving the quality of teaching.

The level of teacher salaries also influences unit costs. Teacher salaries in Francophone Africa are twice as high as in Anglophone Africa, where in turn they are twice as high as in Asia or Latin America. In addition to relatively high salaries, senior university teaching staff also receive bonuses, housing and transport subsidies, health benefits, and travel allowances. At the same time, they are used inefficiently. Senior faculty teach a limited number of hours per week and enjoy paid study leave and extended vacations. Over-diversification of the curriculum and duplication reduces student/teacher ratios and thereby

raise unit costs per student. Among the solutions considered were increasing the number of teaching hours per week and weeks per year of teaching staff, expanding access to part-time students and offering correspondence courses and distance teaching to remedy courses with low enrollments, and narrowing curricular options.

The number of non-academic staff who operate student and teacher services also contributes to high unit costs. In some instances they outnumber students and teaching staff. Despite the abundance and low cost of labor, non-academic staff costs can comprise a significant percentage of the university budget. Employing students for such jobs and outright reduction of non-teaching staff were proposed as feasible solutions to this problem. This implies restriction or elimination of student living allowances as the number of staff operating and managing student services would be reduced.

Traditionally, higher education institutions have been important symbols of national pride and prestige. However, the current economic situation, the lack of sufficient and adequate faculty, and the insufficient number of qualified students make it impossible for each country to offer unlimited access to all types of specializations in the various fields of knowledge. In Sub-Saharan Africa, the number of applicants, particularly in sciences and professional disciplines, is generally very small. Attrition rates are fairly high and most specialized courses end up with a very limited number of students in the upper grades. They also require specialized faculty who are not always easy to find and to hire. As a response to their constraints and needs, a number of countries have established cooperative mechanisms through regional institutions for teaching, research, and accreditation. Despite excessive fragmentation, notions of national identity, and ethnic considerations, African countries have attempted to develop supra-national institutions, generally known as "centers for excellence," in several fields of study.

The maintenance of such cooperative arrangements, especially in a situation of economic austerity, presents its own challenges. So far, the most successful institutions have been funded by international and donor agencies, some of which are no longer able or willing to continue the funding. One of the major reasons is the absence of strong signs of local capacity to absorb these institution-building efforts into regular operations. Some structural characteristics of the centers of excellence make them very expensive to run, and not always easy to monitor their quality and relevance. Three types of institutions exist. First, there are typical international/regional centers, maintained by outside funds. Second, there are consortia of regional or multi-country centers, theoretically supported by the various partners, but which in practice are ill-funded by the host country alone. Third, there are the national centers with international orientation.

The first two types of organizations are increasingly more difficult to support. For instance, there are structural problems associated with faculty careers. To attract the best talent, they offer international-level career patterns, and in so doing, not only increase costs, but also make it unattractive for faculty to go back and work within the constraints of national pay scales. They are difficult to manage since they are not accountable to any single country or authority. They seldom develop a rigorous peer-review mechanism in the international community. Most frequently these institutions lose ties with individual nations and local needs, acquiring a life of their own while remaining unchecked on

performance. Hence their quality is uneven. Currently, most are in severe crisis, in spite of attempts by donor agencies to increase support for their maintenance.

Given scarce resources, the limited number of students, and because they are already a part of local traditions, the idea of centers of excellence remains attractive to most participants. They favored proposals to evaluate existing, and to recommend potential, sites for national and regional centers of excellence for both professional and post-graduate training. They argued that such centers would not only help universities become more responsive to national needs and increase their legitimacy, but would also reduce unit costs of higher education and improve quality.

4
External Efficiency

Manpower

The private returns to higher education in terms of wage differentials remain high in Francophone African countries. Public pressure to expand education precipitated a proliferation of higher education institutions. This expansion of higher education coincided with a shrinking public sector demand for graduates in certain fields as the growth of African economies slowed. However, the demand for scientific and technical graduates is still substantial. The number of students enrolling and graduating in disciplines required for sustained development, such as research, policy, planning, and public administration, remain proportionately low and the quality of their training questionable. African higher education institutions do not provide incentive structures to encourage students into productive fields. Because of the shortage of qualified Africans, substantial numbers of scientific, technical, and professional posts are still held by foreigners. Even within the education sector itself, senior academic teaching and research posts are still filled by expatriates, especially in science, mathematics, and technical education. French technical cooperation alone finances over 1,300 full-time university professors in 26 countries. Over 80 percent of research on Africa is done outside the continent. The University of Dakar, for example, claims that if indigenization of faculty were completed, the university could save up to one third of its current costs.

Forecasting human resource needs continues to be a challenge for planners in all countries of the region. Only tightly controlled planned economies manage to obtain very limited success with such practices, but even then surprises and environmental changes invalidate the best planning efforts. Even though it is becoming increasingly difficult to find jobs in specific areas of specialization, the evidence available suggests that university graduates end up by finding jobs at a faster rate than other less educated groups in their societies, even when such jobs are not entirely compatible with their aspirations and specific qualifications. A university diploma gives the individual a competitive advantage over less qualified applicants for low-skill jobs. Participants reiterated that the prospect of a competitive advantage keeps fueling increasingly high demand for higher education, a fact that is difficult to ignore politically.

Universities need to produce the quantity and quality of graduates that can be absorbed by the local labor market. Since the government is the major employer of higher-education graduates in Sub-Saharan Africa, it should take the lead in providing an incentive system to produce the requisite number of graduates in priority fields. Some ways of accomplishing this that were mentioned during the discussions included altering current wage structures in favor of priority fields suffering shortages; limiting financing to new programs, facilities, and staff where labor market demand for graduates is highest; and encouraging

entrepreneurship among university graduates rather than promising them public sector jobs.

University authorities in some of the participating countries are already attempting to introduce the concept of entrepreneurship into the university. In Cameroon, for example, universities are preparing students to start their own businesses after graduation rather than applying for public sector jobs. Several strategies are being followed. Special courses and training sessions in the professional schools stress applying recently learned skills in small industries or self-owned enterprises. Graduates are more likely to consider starting their own businesses after acquiring practical experience or traineeships in industry and commerce.

Participants cautioned that the idea of entrepreneurship posed several challenges. First, it is not typical of African cultures. Very few traditions of entrepreneurship exist. Besides, local economies are not always attractive for investments. Risks of entrepreneurship are higher than those of a low paying though secure government job. Another major difficulty is the disincentive structures of higher education institutions that subsidize students' every need, rendering individual initiative and entrepreneurial behavior unnecessary. There is also concern that college-level trained people are less inclined to start their own business than lesser schooled people. Relations between universities and public and private enterprises are still in their infancy. However, it is expected that some students will be attracted to the business world.

In spite of recent attempts to cushion the impact of unemployment, the lack of job opportunities for graduates contributes to the erosion of the legitimacy of universities vis-a-vis the broader context of national development. This makes it even more difficult for universities to justify their present practices and their requests for additional support.

Quality

According to some, much of what constitutes a university education in Africa could more appropriately have been acquired at a high-level *lycée*. Over 65 percent of enrollments are in human and social sciences, although there are various institutes, polytechnics, and *Grandes Ecoles* created for specific purposes that operate in isolation and deal with very small numbers of students and faculty. In most institutions no intellectual work beyond conventional teaching is done. Specialized faculties still predominate, with very little opportunity for students to undertake interdisciplinary studies. This is true not only of professional schools, but also of the more general and academic disciplines. Textbooks are scarce and acquisitions for libraries and subscriptions to professional journals have virtually ceased. Other evidence of decline includes deteriorating physical plant, equipment shortages, and lack of equipment maintenance and replacement or upgrading. Even though the relevance and quality of teaching and learning is difficult to measure, comparative data on performance on verbal, quantitative, and analytical sections of the Graduate Record Examination show that African students do not perform as well as Latin American, Asian, and Middle Eastern students.

Although their institutional and operational structures resemble those of high schools, African universities have the status and overhead costs of full-fledged academic universities. Faculty teaching loads for the better qualified staff are low; the division of

labor between senior and junior staff is strictly observed; more highly qualified faculty are required to teach a maximum of three hours per week and have little contact with students outside of classroom interactions. Anyone with a *Doctorat d'Etat* can offer his or her own DEA or a specialized post-graduate course regardless of need, demand, or available resources. At the same time, the great majority of students receive mass instruction from staff with less formal qualifications and academic experience. Except for some characteristics of their management style, universities show neither a specific cultural identity nor an attempt to foster particularly African values in their curricula and other academic activities At the same time, they are seldom in a position to collaborate or even to compete on an equal footing with similar institutions in other parts of the world.

Studies show that achievement is influenced as much by investments in textbooks and other pedagogical materials and equipment as by the number and caliber of faculty. When these quality inputs are lacking, instruction suffers and research ceases. In Sub-Saharan Africa less than 2.7 percent of budgets are allocated for building and equipment maintenance and operational and typical academic expenditures. Universities are producing graduates in applied fields who have never acquired the practical skills or performed the tasks that will be required of them in the real world. If this situation is not rectified Africa will fall even further behind in its ability to generate the knowledge and innovation required for sustained growth and development.

Participants were in favor of sound measures for improving quality and acknowledged that a range of policy initiatives proposed in the background papers for the seminars were desirable. These included establishing performance criteria for students and upgrading instruction and teacher qualifications. However, they noted that such reforms would require additional resources. In a setting of declining public revenues for education and other sectors, finding additional resources appeared problematic. Data pointed out that improving quality would reduce costs and in turn provide additional revenue to implement more quality-enhancing measures. For example, introducing external examinations and tests to monitor performance and to evaluate student achievement could improve the quality of students selected to higher education. Better qualified students would be less likely to repeat grades or abandon their studies and thereby would reduce unit costs. Investments in in-service training for teachers, stocking of libraries, and supplying laboratories and workshops would improve the level of teaching and research and attract and hold well-trained African scholars in priority areas. This in turn would reduce the demand for foreign study and provide incentives for African researchers to do their work in Africa. Although participants were ready to accept the efficiency arguments of such measures they were not convinced that cost savings would be significant enough to finance on-going reform. Here they stressed the cooperation and support of international development assistance agencies.

In the face of financial crisis, coordination is no longer merely desirable, it has become essential. National and bilateral interests have to give way to a more consensual and integrated strategy. A first step is to reach agreement on the general need to improve the quality of higher education in Africa. Economic realities and development imperatives make this first step relatively easy. A gamut of support institutions, mechanisms, and activities need to be strengthened or put in place to help countries to maintain minimally acceptable physical and pedagogical infrastructure for teaching and research. Foreign

money and technical expertise is needed to improve libraries, information systems, and computing capabilities; to train technicians; to develop textbook production; and to develop alternative teaching technologies compatible with adverse geographical conditions and economies of scale. Second, interagency coordination is needed to put in place coherent and adequate incentives for changes to occur in agreed-upon directions. This task is easier when agencies can agree with the countries on the desired directions of change. Given increasingly unbearable constraints and a clearer notion of possible trade-offs and manipulations in the incentive structure for the various actors involved, each country, based on its own history and the lessons of others, can devise specific strategies and select the most appropriate instruments to redress its own higher education system.

5
Alternative Sources of Financing

The dilemma of higher education in Africa is that while there are perhaps justifiable social and economic pressures to expand the sector, national budgets are shrinking and slow economic growth will not accommodate further expansion. Nevertheless the demand for higher education continues to increase in spite of the scarcity of jobs and the crisis of legitimacy of the universities. Relatively easy access, prevailing individual rates of return, increased output from secondary schools, expectations raised in the past, and the attractiveness of social benefits sustains the high level of demand. Even eliminating the link between access to the university and the guarantee of a job in the civil service, already undertaken by some countries, has not diminished interest in higher education. However, if African countries wish to remain integrated into the global economy, structural economic adjustment is an inevitable step.

Whether sectoral adjustment can be undertaken separately, together with or as a consequence of macroeconomic adjustment, is a decision each country will have to consider separately. It is likely that the worsening domestic conditions and the pressure of international financial agencies will play a significant role in the form and substance of structural changes. Among the sectoral adjustment strategies discussed at these meetings, particular attention was given to the possibility of private sources of financing higher education, such as the private sector or students themselves.

Private Sector Contributions

The principal drawback here is that in Sub-Saharan African countries the private sector remains small and the public sector is still the major employer of higher education graduates. Many participants argued that industrial and commercial firms could help fund programs from which they recruited graduates, provide scholarships to replace a portion of government subsidies, or offer high-level training in specialized fields themselves. Others were uneasy about private-sector financing on social, economic, and political grounds and pointed out that the returns would in any case not be significant enough to redress most of the ills of the sector nor to take the political risks involved.

Student Financing

Savings from reducing student allocations seem to be the obvious and immediate source of resources to reshape institutions of higher learning in Africa. First, if students made private investments in their education, they would make more considered decisions on areas of study. Second, students would have more incentive to perform well and would be less inclined to drop out. For equity reasons, it was felt that the beneficiaries of the high

earning capacity of graduate diplomas should participate in their costs. It was noted that loan schemes were a promising alternative for they would provide equal access to candidates from poor socioeconomic backgrounds. Notwithstanding the arguments on both efficiency and equity grounds in favor of introducing user charges to finance higher education, African history, traditions, elite alliances, and political realities make it very difficult to introduce change. A few attempts have been made (Côte d'Ivoire), but the recent dismissal of the minister of education in Cameroon and the problems faced in the Central African Republic, which attempted to introduce selectivity criteria for scholarships, illustrate that it will take an unusual dose of determination to implement reform policies. Cases where there has been limited success indicate the importance of political will coupled with popular mobilization and carefully implemented marketing strategies for even moderate adjustment policies to succeed.

The inequity of the present system seems a more convincing argument. Strategies to address this problem that were raised during the seminar include higher education selection on the basis of areas of priority, merit, grade, or need; introduction of *numerus clausus* for admission in certain careers; progressive elimination of scholarships, starting with new entrants, and so on. However, rectors and directors of higher education institutions who have an important role to play in determining and implementing higher education policy are reluctant because they have no guarantee that the money potentially saved (sometimes at the cost of their jobs) will be returned to the university. Ministers of education, even when convinced of the need to reduce costs, do not have the political will and are not sufficiently convinced of the necessity of implementing such unpopular measures.

As a result of mounting pressure and lack of resources some countries have attempted ad hoc localized improvements. As mentioned earlier, some governments are already uncoupling automatic rights for a civil service job from a university diploma. Some universities are creating differential incentives for students and faculty in the face of specific constraints. These adjustments are not necessarily consistent with each other. The general institutional framework, however, is likely to remain in place. Innovations commonly result in additional expenditures, create exceptions, and make the whole system even more expensive to operate. If lucky, some countries adopting these strategies could capitalize on the success of specific measures or localized adjustments and use them as catalysts for further improvements in other areas.

The aim of adjustment is not that students should pay all their higher education costs. Rather it is to increase their contribution in order to relieve the public burden of finance. Private contribution could take the form of paying a portion of costs (tuition fees, living allowances). Such fees could be paid by means of student loan schemes, national service, or public sector work such as primary school teaching at reduced salaries. In Francophone Africa in particular, it seems that the rate of cost recovery of student loans and graduate taxes, for example, might be significant due to relatively high graduate salaries. Compulsory government service at reduced salaries also seems acceptable to students, but students still remain hostile to repaying a portion of their higher education costs. However, despite recognition of the need for change, existing surveys of the pattern of financing education in the countries represented at the meetings show that in general, tuition is still

free and nearly all living costs are covered. Political reluctance to increase student contributions may weaken as the financial crisis persists.

6
Conclusions

There will always be a demand for government subsidized higher education. There will always be those who argue that people should be allowed to pursue their intellectual interests to the limits of their ability and that this is reason enough to maintain and expand such opportunity. In situations of extreme scarcity, however, public policymakers are forced to weigh priorities and allocate resources in ways that better respond to national needs and available resources. One of the conclusions that emerged from the discussions is that ministers, rectors, and senior education officials are willing to accept sound proposals for cost savings, given the proper incentives. They are aware that the macroeconomic prognosis for the future is one of severe austerity; that resources currently allocated to education are not used effectively; that many policy options exist that could improve the efficiency and the effectiveness of the sector, though all involve political costs.

However, African education officials lack the political support or incentives to successfully surmount the challenges posed by the existing crisis in higher education finance. Higher education officials are reluctant to introduce politically difficult changes to become more efficient if savings acquired from such changes do not remain within the subsector. World Bank staff members listened to ministers express this reluctance in Dakar in 1985 and in Yamoussoukro in 1986, and to university rectors express similar reservations in Victoria Falls in 1987. These discussions proved very useful for rethinking policies and strategies. Bank staff began to consider policies for sectoral adjustment not only in terms of what is economically most effective, but also what is doable. The new Bank policy paper on African education strategies does not mention reallocation away from higher education. Instead it emphasizes the importance of maintaining efficiency and quality, two areas to which cost savings within the sector might be directed. Efforts to increase efficiency in African ministries of education should be supported by additional financial assistance from the donor community to protect education from further reduction in expenditures, to maintain acceptable levels of quality, and to finance needed research.

Follow-up activities of the Bank for the three meetings should emphasize increasing the level of information about and analysis of higher education in Africa on a country by country basis. Such an effort might include meetings similar to these, research, data gathering, and analytical work. The involvement of local researchers in this analysis would increase the likelihood of agreement and cooperation on policy recommendations.

Annex
Program and List of Participants

Séminaire sur la diversification des sources de financement de l'enseignement supérieur en Afrique de l'Ouest
Dakar, Sénégal, du 25 au 26 mars 1985

Dimanche 24 mars

18h30 - 19h30	Accueil et Présentation
	Aklilu Habte et Alexander ter Weele
19h30 - 21h30	Dîner
21h30 - 22h30	Contexte macro-économique
	Paul Isenman

Lundi 25 mars

7h30 - 8h30	Petit déjeuner
8h30 - 10h00	Données sur les coûts de l'Education en Afrique de l'Ouest
	Alain Mingat
10h00 - 10h30	Pause-café
10h30 - 12h30	*Séance 1: Contraintes sur les budgets de l'enseignement supérieur*
	La part de budget d'Etat affectée à l'Education a-t-elle plafonnée?
	Animateur:
	S.E. Monsieur Attaher Darkoye
12h30 - 14h30	Déjeuner
14h30 - 16h00	*Séance 2: Coûts des enseignants*
	• La décomposition du coût des enseignants
	• L'impact potentiel dû à la réduction du coût des enseignants
	• Les répercussions politiques des mesures économiques visant à réduire ce coût

(a) Salaires et avantages

Animateur:

S.E. Monsieur Philippe Somé

16h00 - 16h30 Pause-café

16h30 - 17h30 *Séance 3: Coûts des Enseignants*

(b) Ratio nombre d'enseignants/nombre d'étudiants

Animateur:

S.E. Monsieur Issa Tiendrebeogo

17h30 - 19h00 Libre

19h00 - 21h30 Dîner

Mardi 26 mars

7h30 - 8h30 Petit déjeuner

8h30 - 10h00 *Séance 4: Coûts des étudiants*

- La décomposition du coût des étudiants
- L'impact potentiel dû à la réduction du coût des étudiants
- Les répercussions politiques des mesures économiques visant à réduire ce coût

(a) Frais de scolarité

(b) Frais de logement, de repas, de transport

Animateur:

Monsieur Alexander ter Weele

10h00 - 10h30 Pause-café

10h30 - 12h30 *Séance 5: Financement Privé*

(a) Prêts aux étudiants

(b) Paiement des frais scolaires par les familles

(c) Apport des communautés locales, industries, etc.

Animateur:

S.E. Monsieur K. Agbetiafa

12h30 - 14h30	Déjeuner
14h30 - 15h30	*Séance 6: Actions et Stratégies pour l'avenir*
	Animateur:
	S.E. Monsieur Iba Der Thiam
18h00	Départ

Liste des participants

Burkina

S.E. Monsieur Philippe Somé
Ministre de l'Education Nationale
Ministère de l'Education Nationale

S.E. Monsieur Issa Tiendrebeogo
Ministre de l'Enseignement Supérieur et de la Recherche Scientifique
Ministère de l'Enseignement Supérieur et de la Recherche Scientifique

Niger

S.E. Monsieur Attaher Darkoye
Ministre de l'Education Nationale
Ministère de l'Education Nationale

Sénégal

S.E. Monsieur Iba Der Thiam
Ministre de l'Education Nationale
Ministère de l'Education Nationale

Togo

S.E. Monsieur K. Agbetiafa
Ministre de l'Education Nationale et de la Recherche Scientifique
Ministère de l'Education Nationale de la Recherche Scientifique

Banque Mondiale

Monsieur Aklilu Habte
Directeur du Département de l'Education

Monsieur Alexander ter Weele
Chef de la Division Education pour l'Afrique de l'Ouest

Monsieur Paul Isenman
Economiste principal
Département des Projets Afrique de l'Ouest

Monsieur Stephen Heyneman
Chef de la Division Conception de Programmes d'Education et de Formation
Institut de Développement Economique

Monsieur Sangoné Amar
Assistant d'Opérations
Mission Résidente Banque Mondiale à Dakar

Mlle Angela Ransom
Assistante de Recherches
Division Conception de Programmes d'Education et de Formation
Institut de Développment Economique

Consultant

Monsieur Alain Mingat
Maître de Recherches
Centre National de Recherche Scientifique (CNRS)
Attaché à l'Institut de Recherche sur l'Economie de l'Education
Dijon, France

Séminaire sur la diversification des sources de financement de l'enseignement supérieur en Afrique de l'Ouest
Yamoussoukro, Côte d'Ivoire, du 3 au 5 mars, 1986

Lundi 3 mars

18h30 - 19h30	Accueil et Présentation
	Aklilu Habte, Jean-Claude Eicher et Alexander ter Weele
19h30 - 21h30	Dîner

Mardi 4 mars

7h30 - 8h30	Petit déjeuner
8h30 - 9h30	Contexte macro-économique
	Akbar Noman
9h30 - 11h00	Données sur les coûts de l'Education en Afrique de l'Ouest Alain Mingat
11h00 - 11h05	Pause-café
11h05 - 12h30	*Séance 1 : Contraintes sur les budgets de l'enseignement supérieur*
	La part du budget d'Etat affectée à l'Education a-t-elle plafonnée?
	Animateur :
	S.E. Monsieur Vincent Guezodje
12h30 - 14h30	Déjeuner
14h30 - 15h30	*Séance 1 : Contraintes sur les budgets de l'enseignement supérieur (suite)*
15h30 - 17h00	*Séance 2 : Coûts des enseignants*
	• La décomposition du coût des enseignants
	• L'impact potentiel dû à la réduction du coût des enseignants

	• Les répercussions politiques des mesures économiques visant à réduire ce coût
	(a) Salaires et avantages
	Animateur :
	S.E. Général Sekou Ly
17h00 - 17h05	Pause-café
17h05 - 18h30	*Séance 3: Coûts des enseignants*
	(b) Ratio nombre d'enseignants/nombre d'étudiants
	Animateur
	S.E. Monsieur Hasni Ould Didi
19h00 - 20h30	Dîner
21h00 - 22h00	*Séance 4: Coûts des étudiants*
	• La décomposition du coût des étudiants
	• L'impact potentiel dû à la réduction du coût des étudiants
	• Les répercussions politiques des mesures économiques visant à réduire ce coût
	(a) Frais de scolarité
	(b) Frais de logement, de repas, de transport
	Animateur
	S.E. Monsieur Balla Keita

Mercredi 5 mars

7h00 - 8h00	Petit déjeuner
8h00 - 10h00	*Séance 5: Financement Privé*
	(a) Prêts aux étudiants
	(b) Paiement des frais scolaires par les familles
	(c) Apport des communautés locales, industries, etc.
	Animateur:
	S.E. Monsieur Vincent Guezodje

10h00 - 10h05	Pause-café
10h05 - 12h30	*Séance 6: Actions et Stratégies pour l'avenir* *Animateur:* S.E. Monsieur Jean-Paul Ngoupande
12h30 - 14h00	Déjeuner
14h00 - 16h00	Visite de l'ENSTP
16h00	Départ pour Abidjan

Liste des participants

Bénin

S.E. Monsieur Vincent Guezodje
Ministre de l'Enseignement moyen et supérieur
Ministère de l'Enseignement moyen et supérieur
2-Administration centrale 1
Cotonou, République Populaire du Bénin

Côte d'Ivoire

S.E. Monsieur Balla Keita
Ministre de l'Education Nationale et de la Recherche Scientifique
Ministère de l'Education Nationale et de la Recherche Scientifique
Boîte Postale V-120
Abidjan, République de la Côte d'Ivoire

Mali

S.E. Général Sekou Ly
Ministre de l'Education nationale
Ministère de l'Education nationale
Bamako, République du Mali

Mauritanie

S.E. Monsieur Hasni Ould Didi
Ministre de l'Education nationale
Ministère de l'Education nationale
Nouakchott, Mauritanie

Republic Centrafricaine

S.E. Monsieur Jean-Paul Ngoupande
Ministre de l'Education nationale
Ministère de l'Education nationale
Bangui, République Centrafricaine

Banque Mondiale

Monsieur Aklilu Habte
Directeur du Département de l'Education

Monsieur Alexander H. ter Weele
Chef de la Division Education pour l'Afrique de l'Ouest

Monsieur Akbar Noman
Economiste principal
Bureau du Vice-Président pour l'Afrique de l'Ouest

Mlle. Angela Ransom
Assistante de Recherches
Division Conception de Programmes d'Education et de Formation
Institut de Développement Economique

Consultants

Monsieur Alain Mingat
Maître de Recherches
Centre National de Recherche Scientifique (CNRS)
Attaché à l'Institut de Recherche sur l'Economie de l'Education
Dijon, France

Jean-Claude Eicher
Professeur en Economie de l'Education
Université de Dijon
Dijon, France

Séminaire sur le Financement de l'enseignement supérieur dans les Universités d'Afrique Francophone

Victoria Falls, Zimbabwe, du 23 au 25 janvier 1987

Vendredi 23 janvier

18h30	Réception à Hôtel Victoria Falls
20h00	Dîner à Hotel Victoria Falls

Samedi 24 janvier

8h00- 9h00	Petit déjeuner
9h00-10h30	*Session 1 : Efficience, efficacité et restrictions budgétaires* - - principaux thèmes de discussion (Exposé suivi d'un débat) • problèmes prioritaires • réalisations actuelles *Présentateur:* F. Orivel
10h30-11h00	Pause-café
11h00-13h00	*Session 2 : Efficience et marchés du travail : ajustements du curriculum* • mission de l'université • besoins de main-d'oeuvre • prévisions des ressources humaines
13h00-14h30	Déjeuner
14h30-15h15	Libre
15h15-16h45	*Session 3 : Efficacité interne : carrière et rémunération des enseignants* • formation et utilisation des enseignants • stratégies visant à améliorer la qualité des enseignants • création de centres internationaux d'excellence

16h45-17h00	Pause-café
17h00-19h00	*Session 4 : Questions d' efficacité : effectifs, coût des études et allocations* • la décomposition du coût des étudiants • le recouvrement des coûts: initiatives possibles • l'opposition politique à des réformes • prêts aux étudiants • paiement des frais scolaires par les familles • apport des communautés locales, industrie, etc.
20h00	Dîner

Dimanche 25 janvier

8h00- 9h00	Petit déjeuner
9h00-10h30	*Session 5 : Questions d' efficacité: d' équipement et de fonctionnement* • équipement et entretien • autres formes d'organisation de l'enseignement
110h30-11h00	Pause-café
11h00-13h00	*Session 6 : Rôle de la Banque Mondiale*
13h00-14h30	Déjeuner
14h30-25h00	Actions et stratégies pour l'avenir Evaluation
15h00-15h30	Clôture
15h45	Départ

Liste des participants

Bénin

M. Adekpedjou Sylvain Akindes
Directeur
Complexe polytechnique universitaire
Université de Bénin

M. Souleymane Bassabi
Recteur
Université nationale du Bénin

Burkina

M. Oumarou Clemente Ouedraogo
Recteur
Université de Ouagadougou

M. Halidou Sawadogo
Directeur de la Mobilisation des Ressources Financières
Ministère des Ressources Financières

Caméroun

M. Jacob Lifangi Ngu
Vice-Chancelier
Université de Yaoundé

M. Jean-Claude Abolo
Responsable du Service de l'Enseignement et de la Recherche
Université de Yaoundé

Côte d'Ivoire

M. Toure Bakary
Recteur de l'Université d'Abidjan

M. Konan Celestin
Coordinateur
Comité de Suivi, PAS III
Ministère de l'Economie et des Finances

M. Jean-Baptiste Kouassi Kouame
Responsable du secteur Education/Formation
Ministère du Plan

Mali

M. Abdulla Koita
Conseiller Technique
Ministère des Finances

M. Kaliou Maguiraga
Conseiller Technique
Ministère de l'Education Nationale

Sénégal

M. Magatte Sow
Inspecteur des Affaires Administratives et Finances
Ministère de l'Education Nationale

Togo

M. Tchaboure Gogue
Vice-Recteur
Université du Bénin

Mme Neyram Ketevi
Directrice de la Planification du Développement
Ministère du Plan et de l'Industrie

Banque Mondiale

M. Aklilu Habte
Directeur du Département de l'Education

M. Alexander ter Weele
Chef de la Division Education pour l'Afrique de l'Ouest

M. Joao Oliveira
Chargé de Cours
Division Conception de Programmes d'Education et de Formation
Institut de Développement Economique

Mlle Angela Ransom
Assistante de Recherches
Division Conception de Programmes
d'Education et de Formation
Institut de Développement
Economique

Consultants

M. Joseph Ki-Zerbo
Professeur
Université de Dakar
Dakar, Sénégal

M. François Orivel
Directeur
Institut de Recherche sur l'Economie
de l'Education (IREDU)
Dijon, France

Cheikh Tidiane Sy
Directeur
Ecole Nationale de l'Economie
Appliquée (ENEA)
Dakar, Sénégal

Personnel de Ressource

M. Claude Quirin
Sous-Directeur de l'Enseignement
et de la Formation
Ministère de la Coopération
Paris, France

The World Bank

Ransom

30

ISSN $10.95
ISBN 0-8213-1099-2

Cover design by Susan Foster

The World Bank